



Small TLEF Project – Final Report

Report Completion Date: (2019/04/11)

1. PROJECT OVERVIEW

1.1. General Information

Project Title:	Fostering Excellence in Graduate Supervision at UBC through Dialogue, Resources, and Policy		
Principal Investigator:	Theresa Rogers		
Report Submitted By:	Theresa Rogers		
Project Initiation Date:	March, 2017	Project Completion Date:	March, 2019

1.2. Project Summary

Graduate students’ relationships with their supervisors and their larger scholarly community at UBC is central to their academic progress, their student experiences, their potential as future scholars, and their wellbeing. This project drew on a research-based document to draw into dialogue those who are interested in promoting high quality graduate supervision at UBC, and for developing resources and policy initiatives to continually improve our supervision pedagogy and practices. The outcomes of the project included holding forums, resource development, sharing resources widely across campus, developing approaches to evaluating supervision, showcasing excellent supervisors, and informing survey data. Our ultimate goal was to develop a shared understanding of the principles of excellent graduate supervision at a research-intensive university, and to demonstratively enhance the quality of graduate supervision at the University of British Columbia.

1.3. Team Members – (Please fill in the following table and include **students**, undergraduate or graduate, who participated in your project).

Name	Title/Affiliation	Responsibilities/Roles
Theresa Rogers	Professor/Associate Dean G+PS	Principal Applicant
With the Graduate Supervision Leadership Group	Hillel Goelman (formerly, Interdisciplinary Graduate Studies Program), Sharalyn Orbaugh (Faculty of Arts), Michelle Stack (Faculty of Education), Naoko Ellis (Faculty of Applied Science), Thomas Tannert (formerly of Faculty of Forestry), Vincent Duronio (Faculty of Medicine), Steven Taubeneck (formerly Faculty of Arts), and Timothy Green (formerly of Land and Food Systems), Wendy Hall (Nursing), Susan Porter (Dean and VP, G+PS).	Members of the Graduate Supervision Leadership Group
Jocelyn Micalleff	Masters Student, ECPS	Graduate Research Assistants



Caroline Hamilton	PhD Student, LLED	
-------------------	-------------------	--

1.4. Courses Reached – Please fill in the following table with **past, current, and future** courses and sections (e.g. HIST 101, 002, 2017/2018, Sep) that have been/will be reached by your project, including courses not included in your original proposal (you may adapt this section to the context of your project as necessary).

Course (N/A)	Section (N/A)	Academic Year	Term (Summer/Fall/Winter)
Events	Site		Dates, terms of events
Meetings of Graduate Supervision Leadership Group	Various meeting rooms	2016-17 2017-18	See all dates below.
Enhanced G+PS Workshops	G+PS Supervision Workshops for New Faculty and Graduate Advisors	2017-18 2018-19	Ongoing, each spring and fall.
Indigenous Forum	First Nations House of Learning	2017-18	August 17 th , 2017
Forum on Intercultural Communication	St. John’s College	2017-18	May 10 th , 2018
Sharing aspects of initiative with key stakeholders	TLEF Showcase Graduate Council Senate Teaching and Learning, Senate, GSS, Ombuds Office, Wellness Committee, Council of Deans and others	2017-18 2018-19	May 3 th , 2018 Various meetings Senate Committee Meeting, Spring, 2018, Senate 2018/9
Great Supervisor Week and Celebration	Social media Celebration at Thea’s Lounge, Thea Koerner House	2017-18 2018-19	May 2017, May 2018 Oct. 2017, Nov. 2018
Development of documents	Supervision Principles	2016-19	2017, Posted on G+PS Website, Endorsed by Senate January 2019.
	Scholarly paper on Supervision	2017-19	Autumn, 2018, Submitted to Higher Education journal
	Report on Wellbeing in the supervisory context	Summer 2017	Shared with stakeholders and posted on UBC Sustainability Website
	Great Graduate Programs Document	2018-ongoing	First draft presented to UBC Advising Conference Feb. 2018; ongoing



2. OUTPUTS AND/OR PRODUCTS

2.1. Please **list** project outputs and/or products (e.g. resources, infrastructure, new courses/programs). Indicate the current location of such products and provide a URL if applicable.

Note: These outputs/project correspond to 7 outcomes planned in the original grant proposal. We have included an additional 3 outcomes.

Product(s)/Achievement(s):	Location:
<p>1. Continuing the Dialogue on Excellent Supervision with the expanded Graduate Supervision Leadership Group (Meetings held: February 12, 2016; June 15, 2016; November 2, 2016; February 17, 2017; April 24, 2017; October 16, 2017; December 18, 2017). Small Working Group on Supervision Paper (met on May 31, 2018); key authors (Rogers and Hall) continued to write/confer into Spring and Autumn of 2018. Draft of principles document finalized and posted on G+PS website with resources: https://www.grad.ubc.ca/faculty-staff/information-supervisors/principles-graduate-supervision</p>	<p>Various meeting rooms with refreshments for meetings.</p> <p>Principles uploaded to G+PS Website</p>
<p>2. Professional videos were proposed that would illustrate the principles, but it was decided that our efforts were better placed in other initiatives. See 2.2 below.</p>	
<p>3. We shared and discussed principles with key stakeholders and committees (including GSS, Ombuds office, The Graduate Council, the G+PS Wellness Committee, the Senate Teaching and Learning Committee, and the Council of Deans). The principles are fully supported by the UBC Graduate Advisory Committee. They were presented to the Senate committee on Teaching and Learning in Spring 2018, where it was recommended for Senate endorsement; they were unanimously endorsed at the January 2019 Senate meeting.</p> <p>Use of the principles document to inform supervision workshops for graduate advisors and faculty.</p> <p>The Principles were also shared at the 2017 Canadian Association of Graduate Schools conference in Quebec City.</p>	<p>Date of Senate Principles Endorsement, January, 2019.</p> <p>Ongoing workshops on Supervision for New Faculty and Graduate Advisors at G+PS each Fall and Spring at G+PS.</p> <p>November 2017, CAGS meeting</p>
<p>4. Developed two forums, each followed by working groups and recommendations for next steps: 1) On mentoring Indigenous Graduate Students (in collaboration with First Nations House of Learning); and 2) On Intercultural Communication in the Graduate Supervision Context. Both co-sponsored by the Equity Enhancement project on intercultural communication and graduate supervision. 4a Mentoring Indigenous Graduate Students (August 17th, 2017) https://www.grad.ubc.ca/prospective-students/aboriginal-students/forum-mentoring-indigenous-graduate-students. The event was attended by over 75 faculty, staff, and graduate students.</p>	<p>Forums held at First Nation House of Learning and St. John’s College</p> <p>Follow up meetings with ASPIC, SAGE, Provost</p>



<p>Following this forum, a short-term working group of interested participants was formed to develop recommendations for supporting Indigenous graduate students. These recommendations were then shared with the ASPIC Committee, the Graduate Supervision Leadership group, and G+PS Dean’s leadership team. G+PS is continuing to work on 3 initiatives: 1) Working with Jan Hare to expand the SAGE model across campus, and contributing to or co-sponsoring events such as the 16th Indigenous Graduate Student Symposium (IGSS) on March 3rd, 2018, and the Symposium on Supporting Indigenous Student Persistence and Success on Sept 11, 2018; 2) Exploring new funding opportunities; and 3) Initiating a culturally appropriate welcoming event for new and returning Indigenous graduate students. (Note: a closely related G+PS initiative was funded in Autumn 2018 with strategic planning funds). Finally, in July 2018 we sponsored the first UBCV Indigenous student’s defence of her dissertation in her community (July 13, 2018). https://www.grad.ubc.ca/about-us/newsletter/indigenous-student-first-defend-her-dissertation-campus-land</p> <p>4b. Forum on Intercultural Communication in the Graduate Supervision Context (<i>Exploring Graduate Supervisory Excellence on a Global Campus</i> at St. John’s College, May 10, 2018). https://www.grad.ubc.ca/about-us/initiatives-plans-reports/intercultural-fluency-project</p> <p>This forum, which was co-sponsored by an Equity Office Grant, was attended by over 65 faculty, staff and students, and resulted in a set of recommendations with regard to the capacity building of staff to support the graduate student experience, including intercultural communication awareness in the mentoring of new faculty, and addressing the power differential between students and supervisors through conflict theatre. These recommendations were presented to Provost Szeri with a request for a modest amount of additional funding to further explore and develop these recommendations.</p>	
<p>5. The Graduate Supervision Leadership Group has developed draft recommendations for evaluating supervision for promotion and tenure and for the early evaluations of faculty. We’ve shared and discussed the guidelines with the Graduate Council and the Council of Deans and received feedback for further development of the proposal.</p>	<p>G+PS, Graduate Council</p>
<p>6. We initiated a social media campaign, #GreatSupervisor week. In the spring of 2017, we gathered over 50 student responses; in the spring of 2018, we had over 100. https://www.grad.ubc.ca/about-us/news/celebrate-ubcs-great-supervisors</p> <p>In the fall of 2017 we hosted a celebration for supervisors, who received gifts, and included special guest Provost Szeri. This event was repeated in the fall of 2018.</p>	<p>Social Media, Thea’s Lounge</p>
<p>7. Informing surveys on graduate education. Now that our principles are fully vetted, shared, and endorsed, we have been referring to them as we interact with groups who create surveys (e.g., CGPSS, UBC GSS, etc., and G+PS)</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>



<p>8. A wellbeing report was developed with matching funds from the Sustainability office, an opportunity that arose in spring 2017. This report, written by a sustainability scholar under the principal investigator’s direction, involved both a scan of the resources available for graduate students at UBC as well as interviews with key leaders of the resource offices. The report was posted on the website (see “Wellbeing in the Graduate Student Context, 2017”): https://sustain.ubc.ca/teaching-applied-learning/ubc-sustainability-scholars-program</p> <p>This project was shared with key stakeholders, including a group interested in graduate student wellbeing led by Michael Lee, and was recently funded by TLEF.</p>	<p>Report posted Autumn, 2017</p> <p>New project proposed Spring 2018, funded early 2019.</p>
<p>9. Development of a UBCV Great Graduate Program document. Though this was not initially proposed, it became apparent that there was a need to articulate not only what great supervision is, but how supervision is part of a larger goal of improving graduate programming.</p>	<p>First version presented at UBC Advising Workshop, February 21 2018.</p> <p>(28/39 participants found it “useful or very useful;” we will use feedback to continue working on the document).</p>
<p>10. Sharing of project scope and aim at the TLEF Showcase on Thursday, May 3, 2018 as part of UBC’s Celebrate Learning Week. (See poster attached, on page 8)</p>	<p>Spring 2018</p>

2.2 Item(s) Not Met – Please list intended project outputs and/or products that were not attained and the reason(s) for this.

Item(s) Not Met:	Reason:
<p>As noted above, we have not yet developed the initial professional videos we proposed to illustrate the principles of excellent supervision.</p>	<p>We put some of those resources to other initiatives for filming and editing videos of the speakers at the forums, creating versions appropriate for uploading to the website, and for developing website pages, posters, etc. This use of the resources was more relevant and responsive to the opportunities for collaboration and to address key strategic goals (e.g., Indigenous Graduate students; Intercultural support). Now that the Principles are fully shared, vetted, etc., this could become a project in the near future, possibly in collaboration with CTLT (with whom we have had some preliminary conversations about a web based professional development module). Over half of the funds allocated for this item are being returned.</p>

3. PROJECT IMPACT

3.1. What were you hoping to change or where were you hoping to see an impact with this project? – Please list the intended benefits of the project for students, TAs, instructors and/or community members.

As noted in our original proposal, improving and supporting excellence in graduate supervision speaks to



UBC's core values. Graduate supervision is at the heart of the key principles of the UBC Strategic Plan (then *Place and Promise*, now *Shaping UBC's Next Century*) in terms of transformative student learning, high quality mentoring, student wellbeing, and providing contexts for high quality student research experiences and culture. When UBC graduate students are surveyed about their satisfaction, their relationship with their supervisors is a key issue (e.g., GSS Student Satisfaction Survey Interpretation Report, 2015; GSS Survey, 2018) that often correlates with student wellbeing. With this project, we hoped to use our draft of research-based Principles of Excellent Supervision as the basis for drawing into **dialogue** those who are interested in promoting high quality graduate supervision at UBC, and for developing documents and **resources** and **policy initiatives** to continually improve our supervision pedagogy and practices. We feel we impacted the larger community of graduate supervisors and their students across the UBCV campus, in addition to entering into dialogue with key stakeholders related to graduate teaching and supervision (such as GSS; Graduate Council; the Ombuds Office; ASPIC; the Equity Office; Wellbeing Committee; The Senate Teaching and Learning Committee and the full Senate; Departmental program advisors; the First Nations House of Learning; CTLT; Council of Deans; Sustainability Office; the Provost's office; and supervisors and their students across campus). We also have shared our initiatives on the G+PS website and in the *Advance* newsletter.

3.2. Were these changes/impacts achieved? How do you know they occurred? – *To what extent were intended benefits achieved or not achieved? What evaluation strategies were used? How was data collected and analyzed? You are encouraged to include copies of data collection tools (e.g. surveys and interview protocols) as well as graphical representations of data and/or scenarios or quotes to represent and illustrate key themes.*

We met and surpassed virtually all of our objectives (with the exception of all the videos proposed; see 2.2, above) in terms of expanding the dialogue with the many groups listed above via our numerous meetings, working groups, forums, events, and presentations. We developed resources that include the key document we developed on Principles of Excellent Supervision. We also engaged in several related policy initiatives, such as sharing and posting our Principles, getting them endorsed by Senate, expanding the SAGE model and increasing support for Indigenous Graduate Students, developing recommendations for promoting intercultural communication in the supervision context, proposing approaches to evaluating supervisory pedagogy, acknowledging and celebrating excellent supervisors, informing surveys on graduate supervision, and developing a guide to characteristics of great graduate programming. For meetings, we kept notes and created minutes and agendas as we went; for the forums we kept notes on contributions and recommendations, while evaluating satisfaction with the event through surveys. For the wellbeing report, we undertook an environmental scan of resources and conducted follow-up interviews. The various website links we have provided include examples of our various forms of data collection, evaluation, and feedback. For an overview of project outcomes, see the poster below.

3.3. Dissemination – *Please provide a list of **past** and **upcoming** scholarly activities (e.g. publications, presentations, invited talks, etc.) in which you or anyone from your team have shared information regarding this project.*

Past scholarly activities have been described above, including the two forums featuring keynote speakers who are experts in the fields of Indigenous graduate student mentoring (Dr. Graham Smith from New Zealand, Dr. Jo-Anne Archibald of the Faculty of Education, Dr. Amy Parent of SFU, and Andrea Lyell, UBC PhD Student) and intercultural communication in the graduate supervision context (Dr. Nanda Dimitrov of Western University). The principal investigator also presented aspects of the project as an invited speaker at the November 2017 meeting of the Canadian Association of Graduate Schools. In addition, a scholarly paper that reviews the research and



scholarship supporting the development of the Principles of excellent Supervision has been revised and resubmitted to the scholarly journal, *Higher Education Quarterly*.

4. TEACHING PRACTICES – *Please indicate if **your** teaching practices or those of **others** have changed as a result of your project. If so, in what ways? Do you see these changes as sustainable over time? Why or why not?*

The goals of this project were to raise awareness across campus of the principles of excellent pedagogy in the graduate supervisory context and to generate related dialogues and policies. We have shared the principles and created dialogues at multiple levels of the university, from the Senate to individual supervisors and students, and beyond the university as well. We will continue to look at various survey results relating to graduate supervision at UBCV to see if more students express higher satisfaction related to their supervisory experiences.

5. PROJECT SUSTAINMENT – *Please describe the sustainment strategy for the project components. How will this be sustained and potentially expanded (e.g. over the next five years). What challenges do you foresee for achieving the expected long-term impacts listed above?*

Several aspects of this project will be sustained and expanded in various ways:

- We describe the UBC Principles of Excellent Supervision, which are now posted and endorsed by Senate, as a living document—available to all and to be revised over time. We will continue to add related resources to support excellent supervisory pedagogy, and use this document and resources in various workshops for faculty and students across the UBCV campus, as the basis for ongoing conversations and initiatives.
- The Indigenous Forum, followed by the working group, resulted in several recommendations—including expanding the SAGE program across the UBCV campus. This initiative was recently funded as one Strategic Plan Project:

<https://strategicplan.ubc.ca/core-areas/transformative-learning/strategy-15-student-experience/#expanding-sage-across-the-university>

- The Forum on Intercultural Communication in Graduate Supervision resulted in several recommendations that are being pursued, including requests for additional funding.
- The Principal investigator sits on the Teaching and Learning Committee of Senate, where ideas about supervision are discussed and shared, and is also a member of the Transformative Learning Leadership Table.
- The Wellbeing project was shared with Michael Lee, Susan Cox, and a group of faculty members interested in Student Wellbeing and Graduate Supervision, and their project was recently funded by the TLEF:

<https://tlef.ubc.ca/funded-proposals/entry/378/>

- These various initiatives are going to inform us as we turn to creating a document for developing and maintaining great graduate programs at UBC.
- We would like to develop a professional development module on graduate supervision with CTLT based on these various initiatives.